

Agenda Item 3

All minutes are draft until agreed at the next meeting of the committee/panel. To find out the date of the next meeting please check the calendar of events at your local library or online at www.merton.gov.uk/committee.

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE

15 SEPTEMBER 2016

(7.15 pm - 11.01 pm)

PRESENT Councillors Councillor Linda Kirby (in the Chair),
Councillor John Bowcott, Councillor David Dean,
Councillor Philip Jones, Councillor Andrew Judge,
Councillor Najeeb Latif, Councillor Peter Southgate,
Councillor Geraldine Stanford and Councillor Imran Uddin
Councillor Joan Henry

1 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE (Agenda Item 1)

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Abigail Jones

Apologies for leaving early were received from Councillor David Dean who left the meeting at 10.40pm and so did not participate in the debate or voting for Items 11, 9, 7, and 18.

2 DECLARATIONS OF PECUNIARY INTEREST (Agenda Item 2)

There were no declarations of pecuniary interest.

Councillor John Bowcott made a statement to inform the Committee that he had Chaired the Design Review Panel meeting that considered three of the applications on the agenda (Items 10,13 and 14) but he did not take part in the debate or vote on the proposal

3 MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING (Agenda Item 3)

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 11 August 2016 are agreed as an accurate record.

4 TOWN PLANNING APPLICATIONS - COVERING REPORT (Agenda Item 4)

The published Agenda and Supplementary Agenda tabled at the meeting form part of the Minutes:

a) Supplementary Agenda: A list of modifications for agenda items 5,6,8,10,11,12,13,14,15,and 16 and the late report; Item 18 Summary of Current Enforcement Cases were published as a supplementary agenda.

b) Verbal Representations: The Committee received verbal representations detailed in the minutes for the relevant item.

c) Order of the Agenda – The Chair amended to order of items to the following: 17,5,8,10,12,13,14,15,16,11,9,7 and 18

5 101 ARTHUR ROAD, WIMBLEDON, SW19 7DR (Agenda Item 5)

Proposal: Demolition of existing dwelling house and erection of a new five bedroom dwelling house with accommodation at basement level, together with associated landscaping and parking

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, verbal representations from an objector to the application, and a verbal representation by the applicant's agent.

The Objector raised concerns relating to the demolition of a 120 year old house and that the structural survey for the existing house states that it is in reasonable condition. The applicant's agent stated that even in 'reasonable condition' the existing house still required a large amount of work to bring it up to modern standards

Members asked officers about the condition of the existing house and whether this was a planning consideration. Officers replied that whilst this could be taken into account, the most important factor was that this application proposed to replace a house that makes a neutral contribution to the conservation area with an acceptable replacement which preserves the subordinate relationship to its locally listed neighbouring properties and which sits comfortably within the streetscene.

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

The Committee asked that the Chair and Vice Chair be involved by officers in considering the materials used, in particular the windows and external brickwork.

6 247 THE BROADWAY, WIMBLEDON, SW19 1SD (Agenda Item 6)

Item was withdrawn prior to the meeting date

7 GARAGES REAR OF 4 CAVENDISH ROAD, COLLIERS WOOD, SW19 2EY (Agenda Item 7)

Proposal: Demolition of existing garage block and erection on site of a two storey 2 bed dwellinghouse with basement level and cycle parking

The Committee noted the officers report and presentation and asked officers about the details of the basement construction and noted that pumping systems will be in place to ensure that flooding does not occur.

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

8 443-447 COMMONSIDE EAST, MITCHAM, CR4 (Agenda Item 8)

Proposal: Demolition of existing block of flats and the erection of 6 x 2 bedroom terraced residential dwellings with associated parking, amenity space, cycle storage and refuse storage provision.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information and amended conditions in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation. The Committee received a verbal representation by Ward Councillor Martin Whelton who spoke about the improvements the application would bring in relation to quality of housing, affordable housing and access to the area.

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to s106 legal agreement and conditions, as amended in the Supplementary Agenda

9 17 ELM GROVE, WIMBLEDON, SW19 4HE (Agenda Item 9)

Proposal: Change of Use of existing building from Class B1 Office Use on ground floor and Class D1 Educational Use on the first and second floors to Class D1 Nursery Use with capacity for 65 children on the Ground and First Floors and 2 Self-contained flats at second floor level (1 x 1 bed & 1 x 2 bed). Alterations to building elevations and erection of a new single storey rear extension

The Committee noted the officers report and presentation.

The Committee noted that officers had reduced the maximum number of children from 80 to 65. The Transport planning officer asked members to note the travel plan requested by condition

Members commented on the restrictions placed on the number of children allowed into the outside play area at a time and the limited time allowed outside

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

10 HAIG HOUSING ESTATE, HILL TOP & RHODES MOORHOUSE COURT,
GREEN LANE, MORDEN SM4 5NS (Agenda Item 10)

Proposal: Demolition of garages and erection of 68 residential units with associated parking and landscaping.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, verbal representations from 3 objectors to the application, a verbal representation by the applicant.

The Objector raised residents' concerns including:

- Development should be better quality
- The use of the land could be better
- Parking will be an issue
- The proposed screening planting will take many years to mature
- The loss of an Oak tree is sad and unnecessary
- New blocks are overpowering and oppressive and will overlook existing properties.
- Developers have not listened to residents
- There is a difference in level between new development and Rougemont Avenue so that the new development will look directly into existing first floor windows.
- Family lives, health and wellbeing and Human Rights will all be negatively affected by the proposed development

The Applicant's agent spoke and raised the following points including:

- MOD have provided finance for 68 new homes for servicemen
- There has been an 18 month consultation with all residents
- The open land that will be lost is currently a site of anti social behaviour
- TfL have supported the parking provision
- Extensive new planting has been proposed
- The officers report contains a detailed assessment of the issue of overlooking and overbearing

Members asked officers about the loss of open land. Officers explained that the development would result in an overall loss of open land, but that this had to be balanced against improvement to the landscaping and quality of the remaining land. Members noted that the only SINC (site of importance for nature conservation) would remain. Members asked about parking and noted that condition 14 requested a parking management strategy.

One Member spoke against the loss of the open land and that this land should be protected. Another member commented that the quality of open land would be improved by the development and this had to be balanced against the overall loss of land. Another Member expressed sympathy for the residents of Rougemont Avenue

but reminded the committee that officers had ensured the correct separations between buildings and that views cannot be protected

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to a s106 agreement and conditions

11 150-152 HARTFIELD ROAD, WIMBLEDON, SW19 8EW (Agenda Item 11)

Proposal: Erection of 2 x single storey rear extensions, rear mansard roof extension with 2 x roof terraces in connection with conversion of 150-152 Hartfield Road from 5 x self-contained flats (1 x 1 bed, 3 x 2 bed & 1 x 3 bed) to 7 x self-contained flats (2 x 1 bed & 5 x 2 bed)

The Committee noted the officers report and presentation and amendments contained in the Supplementary Agenda

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to a s106 agreement and conditions

12 32 MOUNT ROAD, WIMBLEDON, SW19 8EW (Agenda Item 12)

Proposal: Demolition of existing garage and erection of 1 x 2 bedroom dwelling house.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, verbal representations from 2 objectors to the application, and a verbal representation by the applicant's agent.

The Objectors raised concerns including:

- Proposal not in keeping with area
- The front door will open directly onto the pavement of Lucian Road
- There has been recent flooding in the area
- Potential damage to tree roots
- Proposal on a busy junction

The Applicant's agent raised points including:

- The area has a mix of developments
- The proposal exceeds national space standards and provides amenity and parking spaces

Officers commented that they could add a tree protection condition, but that flooding issues were already covered by the SuDS (Sustainable drainage systems) condition.

Members commented that they had a concern with the design of the windows, officers suggested that they could add a condition regarding the details of the windows.

RESOLVED

1. The Committee voted unanimously to GRANT Planning Permission subject to published conditions and two additional conditions covering tree protection and design of windows.
2. That the Director of Environment and Regeneration be given delegated authority to agree the detailed wording of the additional conditions

13 POLLARDS HILL ESTATE, MITCHAM (Agenda Item 13)

Proposal: Erection of 90 x residential units (class c3), involving the demolition of 24 existing residential units, alterations to the elevations of retained properties and the construction of new estate access road with associated parking courts and car/cycle spaces (car parking to be increased from 310 spaces to 499 spaces). New landscaping and the provision of waste storage facilities.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information and amended conditions in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, and a verbal representation by Ward Councillor Martin Whelton.

Councillor Whelton expressed the view that on balance this was the right proposal for the estate; although open land would be lost there would be improvements to the estate and the development supplied 60% of homes for social rent and 40% shared ownership.

One member expressed the view that the open land should not be lost and that this was contrary to the Council's Sites and Policies plan 2014.

Other Members stressed the benefits of the development and agreed that the open land to be lost was not of a high quality.

Councillor Joan Henry took no part in the discussion or voting on this item as she had already expressed her view in the Officers report

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to a s106 Legal Agreement and conditions

14 64 - 70 RAVENSBURY GROVE, MITCHAM CR4 4DU (Agenda Item 14)

Proposal: Demolition of garages on Ravensbury Grove and existing flats at 64-70 Ravensbury Grove and the redevelopment of site to provide 21 residential units (c3 use) - comprising 14 x flats and 7 x dwellinghouses with the 14 flats split between 2 x part three, part four storey buildings. Provision of associated vehicular access, parking, cycle and refuse storage and landscaping of the site.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and additional information in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, a verbal representations from an objector to the application and a verbal representation by the applicant.

The Objector raised residents' concerns including:

- The development would ruin the character of the Ravensbury estate and the relationship between the Estate and the views of the park
- Over 50 residents had written objections
- The officers report did not represent the views of the residents

The Agent made the following points:

- Many homes on the estate are defective and many require modernisation
- The proposal delivers affordable housing

Officers asked the committee to note the late changes made to paragraph 7.5 of the Officers report regarding affordable housing such that the paragraph be truncated after 'should the wider regeneration of the Ravensbury Estate not go ahead' and that in its place be inserted;

'The approach to the delivery of affordable housing is based on the advice set out at paragraph 5.1.16 of the Housing SPG 2016 on the subject of Estate Renewal which states that "To achieve no net loss, development at significantly increased density may be necessary to generate sufficient value from market development to support replacement affordable housing provision, or to achieve a more mixed and balanced community. In such a case, the net gain in total provision need not achieve the usual proportion of affordable housing provision expected from a new build development" '

Officers asked the Committee to note that the application was well received by the DRP(Design Review Panel) and that the site to be developed is existing derelict garages.

Members commented that the development would enhance the views into the park and that the impact on wildlife had been mitigated. Members were impressed with the positive view of the DRP.

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to a s106 agreement and conditions.

15 LAND AT RAVENSBURY GROVE, MITCHAM, CR4 4DU (Agenda Item 15)

Proposal: Provision of 36 temporary parking spaces on grass verges and land within the curtilage of numbers 2-18 and 36-50 and either side of Ravensbury Grove and on the corner of Ravensbury Grove and Hengelo Gardens, with dropped curbs, vehicular access and associated landscaping.

The Committee noted the Officers Report and amendments in the Supplementary Agenda, the Officers verbal presentation, verbal representations from 3 objectors to the application and a verbal representation by the applicant

The Objectors raised residents' concerns including:

- Parking outside flats will be a nightmare for residents – especially at night with slamming doors and car lights
- It will bring strangers into flat gardens
- Circle housing have not helped this situation
- Insufficient parking space will be provided
- Speeding on Ravensbury Grove will be an issue
- Concerns regarding tree and root protection were received
- The Council's Tree Officer was not consulted

The applicant raised points including:

- This application is needed as there is no other access to the estate
- At the moment there is no control of parking, this application will put control in
- This will make more parking available
- The permeable surface system will protect trees and their roots
- Hedges will be planted to protect residents from noise and light of parking

Members discussed objectors concerns and asked for proposed conditions to be amended and additions made to cover the following:

1. To install suitable tree protection measures for the duration of the allowed parking:
 - i. The surface of the new car parking area shall be made of porous/permeable material only, to protect trees and their roots
 - ii. Fencing to be installed to protect trees near to the parking area
 - iii. Tree protection measures to be approved by the Council's Tree Officer

2. Landscaping – to ensure that hedges are planted before the start of any parking, to protect residents from noise and light

3. Condition 5 be amended to read:
‘This will be undertaken in a timeframe not exceeding 24 months of the date of this permission or within 6 months of completion of any approved development/regeneration works (whichever is the shorter) unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

RESOLVED

1. The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions
2. The Committee agreed the amendments and additions to Conditions as detailed in the minute
3. The Director of Environment and Regeneration be given delegated authority to agree the detailed wording of the amended and additional conditions

16 VOLANTE SITE, 46-76 SUMMERSTOWN, TOOTING, SW17 0BH (Agenda Item 16)

Proposal: Demolition of existing buildings and erection of a part 7 (top floor recessed), part 9 (top floor recessed) storey building, including accommodation at basement level, comprising 93 flats with 18 associated car parking spaces, 165 cycle parking spaces, hard and soft landscaping and associated works.

The Committee noted the officers report and presentation, and amendments contained in the Supplementary Agenda

Members asked officers about the loss of the Health Centre and noted that a cash contribution had now been agreed instead of the Health Centre

Members commented on the condition regarding the Affordable housing viability review, and noted that Officers would ensure that this was robust.

RESOLVED

The Committee voted to GRANT Planning Permission subject to an s106 agreement and conditions

17 INFORMATION ITEM - WIMBLEDON STADIUM (Agenda Item 17)

The Planning Committee noted the information in the Officers report

Report received

18 PLANNING ENFORCEMENT - SUMMARY OF CURRENT CASES (Agenda Item 18)

Councillor Peter Southgate repeated his previous request that officers investigate the height of the fence between 20 and 21 Church Lane.

Report received.